TRANSPOSITION OF BODY AND MIND; AN INCISIVE THEMATIC AND COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF ‘HAYAVADANA’ BY GIRISH KARNARD AND ‘THE TRANSPOSED HEADS’ BY THOMAS MANN

Dr. PR Chandra Reddy
Associate Professors
Department of Science and Humanities
Mother Theresa Institute of Engineering and Technology
Melumoi, Palamaner, Chittoor Dt, Andhra Pradesh, PIN 517408, India

Abstract—In his own words, Karnard declared that he had borrowed, for Hayavadana one with the head of a horse and body of a man, from the novel, The Transposed Heads, by Thomas Mann, a German writer who had borrowed the plot from a short story from Kathasaritsagara, a magnum opus written in Sanskrit by Somadeva of 11th century. Both Mann and Karnard have depicted sensuality, metaphysics, entangled identities, the problem of love and individuality, an existential humanistic perspective, a philosophical engagement with human conditions, relevance about human sufferings, desire and liberation, sense of alienation, freedom of choice, sensuousness and sensibility, stark reality, absurdity, scopes and limits of human desires and metaphysical emptiness in their works. Hayavadana follows an age-old Yakshagana, which is a traditional theatre style of Southern Karnataka, India. The stories of Devadatta, Kapila, and Padmini and Shridaman, Nanda and Sita center on the conflict between body and mind or mind and matter. The consequences of the confliction reach its zenith after the transposition at the Goddess Kali temple.

Keywords—Body and mind, transposition, reconcile, matchless, destroyer, combination, gandharva, swayamvara, kalpavriksha, stallion, libidinousness, transitory, harbinger, frailty, magic realism.

I. INTRODUCTION

The play Hayavadana is named after a character in the subplot which also suffers from the alienation of body and mind. Although initially the heads, personified by Devadatta and Shridaman win, later, the bodies, personified by Kapila and Nanda demonstrate their equal power over human emotions and actions; ultimately it is mind that rules the roost. As Devadatta and Kapila, in Hayavadana, like Shridaman and Nanda in The Transposed Heads, are unable to reconcile this contrast, ultimately the two young men kill each other and the young women Padmini and Sita burn themselves in a combined funeral pyre. Thus in both the works begin with desire and end with liberation. Jean Paul Sartre says in his Being and Nothingness, ‘The possibility of completion haunts humans and they continue to search for it even when they are convinced that it can never be achieved.’ Here Shakespeare should also be remembered by his Merchant of Venice quote, ‘Some there be that shadows kiss, such have but a shadow bliss.’

II. CONTENT

Paul Thomas Mann was a German novelist, social critic, essayist, and Nobel laureate. He was acclaimed principally for a series of highly symbolic and ironic epic writings, mid-length stories and the psychology of the artist and intellectual. Mann was noted for his analysis and critique of the European and German psyche in the beginning of the 20th century by using modernized German and also the ideas of Goethe, Nietzsche, and Schopenhauer. On the other hand, Girish Karnad was an Indian actor, film director, Kannada writer, playwright and a Jnanpith award recipient. It is the highest literary honour for men and women of letters by the central government of India. He predominantly worked in South Indian cinema and Hindi movies. His rise as a playwright in the 1960s marked the coming of age of modern Indian playwriting in Kannada, just as Badal Sarkar did in Bengali, Vijay Tendulkar has done in Marathi, and Mohan Rakesh has done in Hindi.

The genres of Hayavadana and The Transposed Heads are different, but the plots deal with the complex relationship...
between body and mind. Somadeva, Thomas Mann, and Girish Karnad who almost trod slightly different paths and yet the ultimate objective is identical. Although the plots of Hayavadana and The Transposed Heads are tragic ones, Karnard and Mann recount them in a tongue-in-cheek manner. The two works, drama and novel, have the same plots; the stories have one woman and two men and they have a triangular affinity. The woman who craves for the two men: one who has intelligent mind and other who has a handsome body; and the young lady shares her bed with both men and dies with them in their combined funeral pyre. It’s a kind of punishment for crime as she desires certainty or perfection and can’t bear with uncertainties in life. She comfortably forgets that uncertainty or imperfection or incompleteness is a part of human life. In his drama, The Merchant of Venice, Shakespeare says, ‘Some there be that shadows kiss, such have but a shadow’s bliss.’ The novel and the drama turn out to be a battlefield of the conflict between body and mind. They put the binary of head and body on the horizontal line opposite to the existing vertical line. The story lines take a sharp turn when the two heads are transposed. Transposed Heads and Hayavadana together is a philosophic treatise on relative value of mind and matter, in the form of a myth or some magic realism. The writers have boundless opportunity to hold forth upon the weighing of the influence of the mind on the body. As a matter of fact, man is not satisfied with what he has, he goes on grumbling, moaning and complaining; for him, heard melodies are sweet, but those unheard are sweeter. The Goddess Kali in The Transposed Heads rightly tells Sita, ‘I, the Mother, find fleshy lust pathetic on the whole, and am of the opinion that people are inclined to make too much of it. Anyhow, order there must be.’ Even after that opinion from Kali, Sita sticks to her desire and that can be seen after the transposition of the heads. In Hayavadana, at the beginning of the play, the mask of Ganesha is presented on the stage; it is worshipped and taken away. After that the Bhagavata sings and conjures up Lord Ganesha who is the destroyer of obstacles and harbinger of success, though the God is an ‘embodiment of imperfection and incompleteness with an elephant’s head on a human body with a broken tusk and a cracked belly. Thus the conflict is presented in the very first act. The Bhagavata introduces the theme of the play that in that very city of Dharmapura, ruled by Dharmasheela, there live two youths; one is Devadatta, handsome in appearance, fair and matchless in intelligence. He is the son of a reverend Brahmin Vidyasagar who can never be defeated in debates on logic. The other is Kapila, the only son of a blacksmith of the very city; dark in complexion and plain to look at but he is matchless in physical skills and he is a tower of strength. The two young men are great friends and the city feels wonder at their friendship. They are like Caesar and Brutus, if one is found somewhere, the other is too found there. The Bhagavata sings they are two friends, with one mind and one body. Yet, they are poles apart in fact and the glaring contradiction comes out later. On the contrary, the novel The Transposed Heads begins with third person narration. Both Thomas Mann and Girish Karnard are said to be dialectical writers. They developed a set of themes and ideas, then over their career they developed them more by engaging in the formula of dialectic reasoning: thesis, antithesis, and synthesis, for example Karnard’s another play Nagamandala which also deals with body and mind crisis. In Hayavadana, an actor, Nata, rushes to the Bhagavata in a panicked and nervous state and says that he has seen a horse-headed man, on the road side, who speaks in human voice. Instantly, Hayavadana, a man with a horse head, comes on the stage and sits down. The Bhagavata is surprised as he sees the strange creature. When Hayavadana lifts his head, there are tears in his eyes. A horse head with human feelings . . . . odd combination. The Bhagavata feels that the man is playing a trick by wearing a horse mask. So he commands the man to take it off. As Hayavadana doesn’t move, the Bhagavata and Nata, the actor, try to pull it off but the attempt is futile. The actor declares that it is a real head. The Bhagavata asks him whether he has committed any sin to have that odd form. Upon it Hayavadana becomes a little angry and after some exchanges he narrates his pathetic story. His mother is the Princess of Karnataka. She is known for her beauty. When she comes of age, her father decides to get her married. But he wants to give her a chance of choosing her husband. The news spread far and wide besides, many princes in the world are invited to the public assembly, swayamvara. But she does not like them. At last there comes the prince of Araby. Hayavadana’s mother has fainted on seeing him. The king thinks that is the man she wants to marry. All the arrangements for the wedding are made. Hayavadana’s mother gets up from her unconsciousness and declares that she has fallen in love with the stallion of the Prince, not with the Prince. Her father is awe-struck. For she is very obstinate, she is married off to the horse. After some years, she gave birth to a boy with a horse head. Fifteen years passed and one day in the place of the horse, a handsome celestial young man appears and tells her that he is in reality a gandharva, due to a curse he has got the horse form. Now, because of the human companionship for fifteen years, he is able to get rid of the curse. Then he asks his wife to accompany him to his abode, but she declines the offer. The gandharva becomes angry curses her to become a mare forever and disappears. She, on becoming a mare, runs away happily leaving the boy of their marriage Hayavadana to his fate. He laments as to what he should do with his odd form and implores the Bhagavata how he can get rid of the horse head and become a complete man. Hayavadana adds that in order to get rid of his horse-head, he has visited many holy places like Banaras, Rameswar, Gokram, Haridwar, Gaya, Kedarnath, the Dhargah of Khwaja Yusuf Baba, the Grotto of the Virgin Mary, Churches and also magicians, mendicants, maharshis, fakirs, saints and sadhus.
but there is of no use. The Bhagavata mused awhile and advises Hayavadana to visit the Goddess Kali on Mount Chitrakoot, as a last-ditch effort. It is known that the Goddess there is very benevolent and is always awake to her devotees’ supplicants. Hayavadana thanks the Bhagavata profusely and leaves for the temple being accompanied by the actor, Nata, in search of getting completeness. The Bhagavata starts singing of the two friends they are one mind, one heart.

The two great friends are Kapila and Devadatta; Kapila stands for his physical strength and Devadatta for his powerful mind. They are like Shridama and Nanda in the Transported by Thomas Mann; Shridaman is symbol of strong spiritual qualities with a noble face but a thin, weedy body, on the other hand, Nanda is both a blacksmith and a cowherd with a strong and beautiful body but a rather ordinary intellect. The body and the mind seem to be a good match but they are poles apart and they have different wave lengths and parameters. Both look mono, but there lies a lot of complexity and contradiction between the two. In Bhagavad Gita, Arjuna says, ‘The mind is very fickle indeed O Krishna, turbulent, strong and obstinate. I think it is as impossible to control the mind as it is like the wind.’ Though the people of Dharmapura think that Devadatta and Kapila are like Lava and Kusa, the two friends prove themselves what they really are when a young girl comes between them with her own likes and dislikes. In the words of the chorus, the disaster of the future of the three can be perceived. The female chorus gives rise to many speculations. The young lady is really a harbinger of chaos between the two friends. Commenting on the two friends, Thomas Mann says, ‘The friendship between the two youths was based on the diversity in their, ‘I and my feelings,’ those of the one yearning towards those of the other. Incorporation, that is, makes for isolation, isolation for difference, difference makes for comparisons, comparisons give rise to uneasiness, uneasiness to wonderment, wonderment tends to admiration and finally admiration turns to a yearning for mutual exchange and unity.’

Devadatta enters the stage and sits in a chair. He is slender and delicate. Kapila also comes on the stage now and the conversation begins. Kapila talks unmindful of his friend’s pensive mood first and later perceives that it must be some girl who bothers Devadatta’s mind as has happened on many an occasion earlier. Devadatta tells Kapila that he has seen a young maiden whose face is like a white lotus and her arms are like the lotus creepers. He declares that he can outshine Kalidasa in writing, if she becomes his inspiration by becoming his wife. He goes on further to declare that if she becomes his wife, he will sacrifice his two hands to the Goddess Kali and his head to Lord Rudra. Speaking about Sita, in the Transposed Heads, Shridaman opines, ‘Sita is all and not only one; life and death, madness and wisdom, enchantment and repulsion.’

Kapila understands the gravity of the situation. He consoles Devadatta and takes the responsibility of mediating with the beautiful maiden who lives in Pavana Street in a house at the top of whose door there is an engraving of a ‘two headed bird.’ The two heads are a symbol of inconsistency in thinking and it can be found in Padmini as a play continues. A knock at the door brings Padmini out and Kapila speaks to her for a while and muses that his friend has knocked at the wrong door. Devadatta’s marriage with Padmini would be a mismatch, as both are incompatible. But he can’t go back in the matter; there is no way other than proceeding so he speaks with her parents. Devadatta’s house is an abode of the Goddess of learning whereas the Goddess of wealth dwells in Padmini’s house. Thus there is nothing that can stand in the way of bringing the two families together with a wedding. Wealth and knowledge have become one and Padmini has become Devadatta’s wife.

The marriage brings no change in the intimacy of the old friendship, besides it flourishes further. Devadatta - Padmini - Kapila, to the people of Dharmapura, are Rama - Sita - Lakshmana. But there comes something else as time passes. Due to the frequent visits of Kapila and moreover Padmini’s admiration for his physique and civility, Devadatta feels that his friend has become a thorn in the flesh in their private moments. Padmini on the other hand, quite unmindful of her husband’s thoughts, feels at home in Kapila’s presence and so does Kapila. In the Transposed Heads, Sita speaks of desire and dissatisfaction and tells the Goddess Kali, ‘Shridaman did indeed awake me to desire but could not still it.’ The Goddess feels that some reconciliation is necessary so that the institution of marriage be kept inviolate. But those words would have no alter in Sita’s way of thinking. She has no control over her emotions.

Here, very soon Padmini conceives. The trio plan to go to Ujjain on a short visit. On the day of the journey, Padmini looks through the window and asks for Kapila, which annoys Devadatta. They talked about Kapila but it is difficult to make it out from the conversation, whether Devadatta is jealous of Padmini or Padmini is in love with him; probably they are careful to each other’s feelings. Devadatta says that Padmini is not merely a friend --- he is like his brother. He goes to the extent of saying that one has to collect one’s merit for seven lives to get a friend like Kapila. He clarifies again that he is no longer jealous of him. Padmini in her turn says, assuring her husband that she is his better half and she is ready even to drop Kapila from the trip. The wife and husband employ mere duplicity to cover their real feelings. But Sita in The Transposed Heads agrees and tells Kali, ‘Nanda might be the man to lift my joy to the level of my desire.’

Padmini’s voice is steady and decisive. Everyone feels she is true to her husband in every sense of the word. Any husband feels elated when he hears such words from his better half. Thus the words pacify Devadatta and he reiterates that he is no longer jealous of Kapila and says that his friend’s heart is made of gold. Shakespeare can be remembered here, ‘All that glitters is not gold.’ Devadatta says that what matters more to
him is Padmini’s health. Responding to it Padmini says that she has a womb of steel and she is fit like a fiddle. Yet, they decide to cancel the trip. But no sooner have they cancelled the trip than Kapila enters saying he has made all the arrangements for the trip. He feels his heart sinking on learning that the journey is called off.

Kapila becomes a little introvert and muses why he feels as though the whole world has been wiped out because of the cancellation of the trip and he makes up his mind not to come there for a week or he may lose his heart. Liking Padmini is infatuation and immorality. In the meantime Padmini who observes the whole thing, and announces that she is ready to go on the trip, which shocks both the friends. Shakespeare is remembered again, ‘Frailty thy name is woman.’ Later she tells Devadatta that she cannot see the gloomy face of Kapila, but there is no point in it. The journey begins and Kapila drives the cart. Padmini compares that the driving of Kapila is far better than that of her husband. Devadatta maintains silence and thinks, ‘The head is bidding good-bye to the heart.’ When Kapila climbs the Fortune Lady’s tree for flowers, Padmini admires the strength of Kapila silently.

Padmini sees a celestial being reborn as a hunter in Kapila. The forlorn Devadatta needs no litmus test to be conversant with Padmini’s passion for Kapila. He notices how she is pouring her soul in Kapila’s mould. In her eyes he sees flames leaping up from the depths of her mind. But it is late…. yes it’s too late. There is some conversation but it is merely a platitudine. In the meantime, Kapila says that the river of Bhargavi, the temple of Rudra and also the temple of the Goddess Kali are just around the corner. That startles Devadatta and he remembers his unfulfilled vow. At last, when Kapila and Padmini leave for Rudra temple, Devadatta goes to Kali temple, begs forgiveness for his failure in his promise and cuts off his head with a sword that he has found there. A right action at the wrong place, he has promised his head to Lord Rudra.

Kapila and Padmini are worried on their return as Devadatta is not found. Being more worried than Padmini, Kapila reaches the temple of the Goddess Kali, witnesses the agonizing locale, feels guilty and beheads himself. Their long absence state of Padmini. Like Bhagavata, the role performed by the dolls becomes imperative. They disclose that Devadatta’s strength fades over time, and they narrate Padmini’s changing choice of preference and her dreams to the audience as she longs for Kapila now. She longs for hearing the unheard melodies. The doll-episode is remarkably the playwright’s innovation which helps him clarifying to the audience the emotional dilemma of the characters, the passage of time and especially the inner conflict of Padmini. The first doll reveals the change in Devadatta’s physique; he has been strong six months ago and now he is delicate. Due to some difference of opinion, the two dolls fight with each other and their clothes are torn and so Padmini suggests her husband that he should go to Ujjain fair to buy new dolls for the child. This suggestion turns the tables in the play as she wants to find out what has happened to Kapila, in the absence of her husband. Padmini sets aside all her husband’s other alternatives and insists on going to the fair of Ujjain for new dolls. The two dolls don’t
like it for they suspect that Padmini would go to Kapila, but they can do nothing. Here ends their role.

Though mind, sitting securely in the head and can’t survive without body, it is the command center of the body. It imposes the likes, dislikes and memories on the body. Milton says, ‘The mind is its own place, and in itself can make a heaven of hell, a hell of heaven.’ As a result, Devadatta’s body surrenders itself to his mind. His muscles begin to give way because of his desk work, reading, thinking and writing. Padmini doesn’t get any sweaty strong male odour from Devadatta and that makes her remember Kapila. As Devadatta’s body becomes sensitive, Padmini thinks Kapila’s body might have become stronger. At last, she sends her husband to Ujjain and she sets off, along with her son, for the forest to see Padmini. She knows well where he lives. Kapila is awestruck, when he catches sight of her and he doesn’t like her coming there. Looking at the child in her arms, Kapila asks if the child is hers and she replies that the child is his. Kapila hesitates to accept it. She observes that the jungle hard work has converted the delicate body into a strong one. Kapila also says that his body has accepted his head. Padmini re-kinds the old fire in Kapila who, first, resists but when she touches him, the body recognizes her touch. She presses his head into her bosom and then rests her head on his chest. She feels that her search for completeness has taken a full circle.

Padmini stays with Kapila for two days.

At this juncture, Devadatta arrives there with a sword in one hand and two dolls in the other. Kapila is neither shocked nor surprised; in fact he is awaiting and expecting him. Padmini comes out of the hut and stands watching them. Both Devadatta and Kapila look at each other that are as they have been once physically because the minds have changed their bodies. But the bodies originally don’t belong to the heads. After a little conversation, they confess that both are in love with Padmini. The two come to a pact that they must live with her like Pandavas with Draupadi but it is promptly ruled out by Padmini, though she is simultaneously in love with one man's body and another man's head. Then the final solution is a fight between the two till they die. The duel begins and ends with the death of both. Padmini is left alone with the child and the two dead bodies. She hands over the child to the Bhagavata to put him in the care of the hunters in the forest, telling them that he is Kapila’s son and when he gets five, he should be given to Davadatta’s parents with the information that he is their grandson. Here she does some justification to body and mind. Padmini prepares for sati and arranges a large funeral pyre and burns herself with the two dead bodies. Death is the end of minds and funeral is the end of the bodies.

The Bhagavata does a namaskaara (a greeting with folded hands) to the audience to give the feeling that the play has come to an end. Meanwhile the Actor II rushes on to the stage in a hurry and reports to Bhagavata that he has seen a horse, which is singing the National Anthem and other patriotic songs aloud. There is a commotion again and Actor-I enters now with a boy of five in his hands. The boy is very morose, serious faced and even sulky. There’s not a trace of smile or laughter on his face but he is holding two dolls. Actor - I says again that when he is on his way back home, a tribal woman gives the boy to him and the boy never allows anyone to touch the dolls.

At this juncture they hear the ‘National Anthem’ Jana Gana Mana. They all stare in the direction of the song. A horse enters on the stage singing and the Bhagavata remembers that it is Hayavadana. The old acquaintances meet again and when they laugh, the boy also starts laughing. The two dolls fall from his hands as he claps his hands and laughs and thus he lost his moroseness and becomes a normal boy. In The Transposed Heads the boy, Samadhi, born to Shridaman and Sita suffers from lack of good eyesight, thus he is nicknamed as Andhaka; ultimately in the hands of a Brahmin, he becomes a scholar and is appointed as the reader of the King of Benares at the age of 20. In the play, Hayavadana narrates the Bhagavata his long story. He has gone to the Kali Temple at Chitrakoot, picked up the sacrificial sword to severe his horse head. Meanwhile Kali appears and asks him what he wants. He cries to the Goddess and begged her to make him complete. At once, Hayavadana turns into a complete horse and the Kali disappears. Here the Goddess has taken the head as the decisive factor.

Hayavadana is utterly disappointed with the Goddess Kali who is indifferent to the yearnings of people. He has become a complete horse but not a complete being for he is a horse with a human voice. He finds no way to get rid of the voice. So he sings the National Anthem and other patriotic songs at the top pitch of his voice to spoil his vocal chords, but it doesn’t work out. It is the playwright’s humorous tinge to the play. But when Hayavadana laughs, on the boy’s asking him to laugh, the laughter turns into a perfect neigh. The human voice is lost; he neighs and leaps around joyfully with the boy on his back. Bhagavata asks Actor-I and Actor-II to go and inform the revered Brahmin Vidyasagar that his grandson is returning home. The Bhagavata declares the end of the drama with a prayer to the God Ganesha for the successful enactment and The Transposed Heads ends with the twenty year old Samadhi keeping the sacred and profane writings close to his eyes and reading for the king of Benares in the palace.

The beginning of the novel, The Transposed Heads, is quiet, peaceful and orderly with a beautiful rural backdrop and with an order. But it ends with noise, blowing of conches, rolling of drums, chaos, tears, fight and with disorder. But order comes out of disorder. Similarly, the drama Hayavadana begins with a rural background and a rustic drama setting. The entry of Hayavadana and the words of the actor evoke laughter. The audience may think that the drama would be enacted in a lighter vein. But the dramatist gives it topsy-turvy turns. Human beings console themselves with the thought that they shall live in peace after the death, but what about the conflicts during the life, often the surfeits of their own behaviour?
Shakespeare is remembered, ‘To be or not to be that is the question.’ The question seems simple, but while facing it, the complexity can be understood. There is such complexity among the two trios: Shridaman, Nanda and Sita – Devadatta, Kapila and Padmini. Both the young ladies die to escape the mental struggle between morality and physical desire, it was kind of punishment for them. In other words, death can only solve the problems in The Transposed Heads and Hayavadana. But the alternative of dying is living bearing the unbearable mental agony and social accusation. Here, death becomes tolerable and life becomes intolerable. The juxtapositions are so apparent that even a layman thinks that the end of the six lives is the only better solution.

III. CONCLUSION
Hayavadana and The Transported Heads have the tinge of magic realism, is a fashion of literary fiction and reality. It presents a realistic view of the world while also adding magical elements, often blurring the lines between fantasy and reality. Magic realism often refers to literature with magical or supernatural phenomena presented in an otherwise real-world, and it is commonly found in novels and dramatic performances. In both the works, there are fantastical elements like the dead come to life, heads transplantation, appearances of Gods and Goddesses and humans with animal heads. The play, Hayavadana ceases with a prayer to God who has fulfilled the desires of all and solving the complexity of the transposed heads: a grandson to a grandfather, a smile to a child, a neigh to a horse, an end to the transposed heads and death to the lady who craves for sensuality. The end of the play is tragic as the two friends killed each other and the lady committed sati and the boy is left parentless and so is the end of The Transposed Heads, Shridaman and Nanda are to kill each other, and Sita is to die a ritual death on her husband's funeral pyre. This duly happens with little Samadhi-Andhaka lighting the flames. The play and the novel take the problem of the transposed heads to the zenith and bring down to the mundane level. The two works follow the psycho analytical explanation of Norman O. Brown: the three phrases: primal unity, differentiation and final unity. Lastly, Aristotle argued that being moral has to do with the function of a human being and in developing his argument he moved from the non-moral to the moral uses of good and bad. He suggested that anything that is good or bad is so because it functions well or poorly. If we could discover what the function of a human being is, then we would know how the term good or bad can be applied to human life. Since reason is the proper function of human being, he concluded that being moral essentially means ‘reasoning well for a complete life.’ The Goddess Kali advises the same to Sita, ‘I insist on order and I must definitely protest that the institution of marriage be kept inviolate.’ As man has limited freedom, his desires should also be limited otherwise, there would be chaos. Chanukya says, ‘Anything in excess is poison.’

IV. REFERENCES